



COLORADO

Department of
Regulatory Agencies

Division of Real Estate

1560 Broadway, Suite 925
Denver, CO 80202-5111

BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS MEETING

Meeting Minutes

November 2, 2023

MINUTES - INDEX

	<u>PAGE #</u>
ORDER OF BUSINESS BY THE CHAIR:	
Call to Order, Roll Call, Determine Quorum	2
MINUTES	
September 7, 2023	3
POLICY MATTERS:	
A. Delegations of Authority	3
B. 2024 BOREA Calendar	4
CITIZEN PARTICIPATION	4
COMPLAINT MATTERS:	
A. Complaint #2023-1447	4
EXECUTIVE SESSION	4
ATTORNEY GENERAL MATTERS:	
A. Complaint #2022-2125	5
ADJOURN	5

MINUTES
BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS
November 2, 2023
Colorado Division of Real Estate
Meeting Conducted Via Webinar

A Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers public meeting was conducted via Webinar and was held on Thursday, November 2, 2023.

Notice of the meeting was published timely and the meeting was held pursuant to the Colorado Sunshine Laws, Title 24, Article 6, C.R.S., as amended.

ORDER OF BUSINESS BY THE CHAIR:

Call to Order, Roll Call, Determination of a Quorum-

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Mickey Sanders, Chair. Director Marcia Waters made a quorum determination.

Board Members in Attendance: Mickey Sanders, Chair; Christopher Chippindale, Vice-Chair; Patrice Campbell; Daisy Glassburn; Brent Goff; Rob Stilo; and Clint Taylor.

Also attending via webinar: Marcia Waters, Director; Eric Turner, Deputy Director; Melissa Phipps, Senior Advisor; Penny Elder, ESP Manager; David Donnelly, Education, Communication & Policy Manager; and Doreen Archuleta, Board Manager. Gina Simonson and Zach Fitzgerald were present via webinar from the Office of the Attorney General. The meeting webinar was open to the public.

RULEMAKING HEARING - Rules Governing the Practice of Real Estate Appraisers:

- Chapter 1 - Definitions
- Chapter 2 - Requirements for Licensure as a Real Estate Appraiser
- Chapter 3 - Standards for Real Estate Appraisal Qualifying Education Programs
- Chapter 4 - Standards for Real Estate Appraisal Licensing Examinations
- Chapter 5 - Standards for Real Estate Appraisal Experience
- Chapter 6 - Application for Licensure
- Chapter 7 - Continuing Education Requirements
- Chapter 8 - Renewal, Reinstatement, Inactivation, Surrender or Revocation of Licensure
- Chapter 9 - Licensure by Endorsement and Portability of Professional Licenses of Service Members and Their Spouses
- Chapter 10 - Temporary Practice in Colorado
- Chapter 11 - Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice

- Chapter 12 - License Titles, License Documents and Signatures
- Chapter 13 - Disciplinary Procedures
- Chapter 14 - Declaratory Orders Pursuant to Section 24-4-105(11), C.R.S.
- Chapter 15 - Board Review of Initial Decisions and Exceptions
- Chapter 17 - Licensing Requirements for Appraisal Management Companies
- Chapter 18 - Professional Standards - Appraisal Management Companies



4 CCR

725-2.Adopted.11.02.:

It was moved by Mr. Chippindale and seconded by Ms. Campbell to Adopt Chapters 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17 and 18 as read by Deputy Director Eric Turner (Chapters 1-9) and by Senior Advisor Melissa Phipps (Chapters 10-18).

Motion unanimously carried.

The Board of Real Estate Appraisers adjourned out of the Rulemaking Hearing meeting at 10:11 a.m. on November 2, 2023.

MINUTES APPROVAL - September 7, 2023

After review, it was moved by Mr. Chippindale and seconded by Mr. Goff to approve the Minutes of the regular Board meeting on September 7, 2023 as written.



BOREA

Minutes_September 7

Motion unanimously carried.

POLICY MATTERS:

Delegations of Authority -

It was moved by Ms. Campbell and seconded by Ms. Glassburn to approve updated Delegations of Authority as presented.



BOREA Delegations
of Authority_2023_Cl

Motion unanimously carried.

2024 BOREA Calendar -

January 4, 2024
March 7, 2024
May 2, 2024
July 11, 2024
September 5, 2024
November 7, 2024

Agenda Items for Next BOREA Meeting - None

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Scott DiBiasio

COMPLAINT INVESTIGATIONS:

A. Complaint No. 2023-1447 (Robert Walker, Investigator)

Director Marcia Waters presented this matter to the Board.

The report alleged violations of: §12-10-613(1)(g) C.R.S.; §12-10-613(1)(j) C.R.S.; §12-10-613(1)(b) C.R.S.; USPAP violations include Ethics Rule; Competency Rule; Scope of Work Rule; Record Keeping Rule; Standard Rule 1 and Standard Rule 2.

Ms. Campbell moved and Mr. Chippindale seconded that the Board finds reasonable grounds exist to believe that violations of appraisal law occurred in Complaint No. 2023-1447. The Board voted to refer back to Staff for a settlement offer for a Stipulation for Diversion to include Work Product Review of 4 appraisals within 2 months; and coursework to include 5 or more hours in Data Verification; 7 or more hours in Comparative Analysis and/or Supporting Adjustments; Reliable Recordkeeping; and TAF: Scope of Work: Appraisals and Inspections.

Motion unanimously carried.

EXECUTIVE SESSION:

At 10:28 a.m. it was moved, seconded and approved by more than two-thirds vote by the Board that pursuant to §24-6-402(3)(a)(II), C.R.S., to convene the Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers into Executive Session for the purpose of receiving legal advice pursuant to C.R.S. §24-6-402(3)(a)(II) concerning disputes that are the subject of pending or imminent court action and/or for the purpose of receiving legal advice regarding Attorney General Matter - Complaint No. 2022-2125.

Motion unanimously carried.

Executive Session is conducted via Google Hangout Meeting.

The Board adjourned out of Executive Session at 10:36 a.m. and resumes meeting via webinar that is open to the public.

ATTORNEY GENERAL MATTERS:

A. Complaint No. 2022-2125 - Counteroffer

Following discussion in Executive Session, it was moved by Mr. Goff and seconded by Mr. Taylor to reject the counteroffer in Complaint No. 2022-2125.

Motion unanimously carried.

ADJOURN:

The regular meeting of the Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers adjourned at 10:37 a.m. on November 2, 2023.

Mickey Sanders, Chair

Christopher Chippindale - Vice-Chair

Patrice Campbell

Daisy Glassburn

Brent Goff

Rob Stilo

Clinton Taylor

Marcia Waters, Director
Colorado Division of Real Estate