



COLORADO

Department of
Regulatory Agencies

Division of Real Estate

1560 Broadway, Suite 925
Denver, CO 80202-5111

BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS MEETING

Meeting Minutes

January 4, 2024

MINUTES - INDEX

	<u>PAGE #</u>
ORDER OF BUSINESS BY THE CHAIR:	
Call to Order, Roll Call, Determine Quorum	2
CE CREDIT FOR BOARD MEETING ATTENDANCE	2
MINUTES	
November 2, 2023	2
CITIZEN PARTICIPATION	3
COMPLAINT MATTERS:	
A. Complaint #2023-1882	3
B. Complaint #2023-2374	3
C. Complaint #2023-1129	4
ESP MATTERS:	
A. Complaint #2023-765	3
EXECUTIVE SESSION	4
ATTORNEY GENERAL MATTERS:	
A. Complaints #2022-795 & #2022-890	4
ADJOURN	5

MINUTES
BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS
November 2, 2023
Colorado Division of Real Estate
Meeting Conducted Via Webinar

A Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers public meeting was conducted via Webinar and was held on Thursday, January 4, 2024.

Notice of the meeting was published timely and the meeting was held pursuant to the Colorado Sunshine Laws, Title 24, Article 6, C.R.S., as amended.

ORDER OF BUSINESS BY THE CHAIR:

Call to Order, Roll Call, Determination of a Quorum-

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Mickey Sanders, Chair. Director Marcia Waters made a quorum determination.

Board Members in Attendance: Mickey Sanders, Chair; Christopher Chippindale, Vice-Chair; Patrice Campbell; Daisy Glassburn; Brent Goff; Rob Stilo; and Clint Taylor.

Also attending via webinar: Marcia Waters, Director; Eric Turner, Deputy Director; Melissa Phipps, Senior Advisor; Penny Elder, ESP Manager; David Donnelly, Education, Communication & Policy Manager; and Doreen Archuleta, Board Manager. Zach Fitzgerald was present via webinar from the Office of the Attorney General. The meeting webinar was open to the public.

CE Credit for Board Meeting Attendance -

Deputy Director Eric Turner advised the Board that CE credit is available for BOREA Board Meeting attendance to include webinars. To receive CE credit, the Board must meet for a minimum of two hours and the attendee must remain online for the entire meeting.

MINUTES APPROVAL - November 2, 2023

After review, it was moved by Ms. Campbell and seconded by Mr. Chippindale to approve the Minutes of the regular Board meeting on November 2, 2023 as written.



BOREA

Minutes_November 2

Motion unanimously carried.

POLICY MATTERS: None

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- JoAnn Apostol

COMPLAINT INVESTIGATIONS:**A. Complaint No. 2023-1882 (Robert Walker, Investigator)**

Director Marcia Waters presented this matter to the Board.

The report alleged violations of: §12-10-613(1)(g) C.R.S.; USPAP violations include Scope of Work Rule; Record Keeping Rule; Ethics Rule; Standard Rule 1 and Standard Rule 2.

Ms. Campbell moved and Mr. Goff seconded that the Board finds reasonable grounds exist to believe that violations of appraisal law occurred in Complaint No. 2023-1882. The Board voted to refer back to Staff for a settlement offer for a Stipulation for Diversion to include coursework of 15 or more hours in Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies; 7 or more hours in Residential Report Writing and a 15-hour National USPAP course.

Motion unanimously carried.

B. Complaint No. 2023-2374 (Robert Walker, Investigator)

Director Marcia Waters presented this matter to the Board.

The report alleged violations of: §12-10-613(1)(i) C.R.S.

Mr. Chippindale moved and Mr. Taylor seconded that the Board finds reasonable grounds exist to believe that violations of appraisal law occurred in Complaint No. 2023-2374. The Board voted to dismiss the case with a Letter of Concern.

Motion unanimously carried.

NOTE: The Board took items out of Agenda order and considered ESP Matter A before Complaint Matter C.

ESP MATTERS:**ESP Matter A - Complaint #2023-765 -**

The Board was presented with information by Penny Elder regarding ESP Matter A, Complaint #2023-765. It was moved by Ms. Campbell and seconded by Mr. Taylor to authorize practice work product review reports for two appraisals and two standard appraisals with a six-month extension to be completed by the respondent.

Motion unanimously carried.

NOTE: Ms. Glassburn recuses herself from consideration of Complaint Matter C - #2023-1129 and leaves the webinar at 9:29 a.m.

EXECUTIVE SESSION:

At 9:35 a.m. it was moved, seconded and approved by more than two-thirds vote by the Board that pursuant to §24-6-402(3)(a)(II), C.R.S., to convene the Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers into Executive Session for the purpose of receiving legal advice pursuant to C.R.S. §24-6-402(3)(a)(II) concerning disputes that are the subject of pending or imminent court action and/or for the purpose of receiving legal advice regarding Complaint Matter C - #2023-1129; and Attorney General Matters - Complaints #2022-795 and #2022-890.

Motion carried.

Executive Session is conducted via Google Hangout Meeting.

NOTE: Executive Session begins with discussions on Attorney General Matters - Complaints #2022-795 and #2022-890 and Ms. Glassburn participates in those discussions. When the Board begins discussions concerning Complaint Matter C - #2023-1129 at 9:46 a.m., Ms. Glassburn recuses herself and leaves the Google Hangout Meeting.

The Board adjourned out of Executive Session at 10:00 a.m. and resumes meeting via webinar that is open to the public and Ms. Glassburn remains recused.

C. Complaint No. 2023-1129 (Robert Walker, Investigator)

Director Marcia Waters presented this matter to the Board.

The report alleged violations of: §12-10-614.

Ms. Sanders moved and Mr. Taylor seconded that the Board finds reasonable grounds exist to believe that violations of appraisal law occurred in Complaint No. 2023-1129. The Board voted to refer back to Staff for a settlement offer for a Stipulation and Final Agency Order to include a one-year suspension and a \$5,000 fine (plus 15% mandatory surcharge).

Motion carried.

NOTE: Ms. Glassburn returns to the webinar at 10:10 a.m.

ATTORNEY GENERAL MATTERS:

A. Complaints #2022-795 and #2022-890 -

Following discussion in Executive Session, it was moved by Ms. Sanders and seconded by Mr. Stilo to include additional violations and to seek maximum fines in Complaints #2022-795 and #2022-890.

Motion unanimously carried.

ADJOURN:

The regular meeting of the Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers adjourned at 10:12 a.m. on January 4, 2024.

Mickey Sanders, Chair

Christopher Chippindale - Vice-Chair

Patrice Campbell

Daisy Glassburn

Brent Goff

Rob Stilo

Clinton Taylor

Marcia Waters, Director
Colorado Division of Real Estate